Intertextuality and Glocalization: A Corpus-based Analysis of Advertisement Texts of an International Female Fashion Magazine[1]

Cao Shuo[2], Shi Zhenmei[2]

ARTICLE INFO	ABSTRACT
	In the context of the globalization of business, it is becoming increasingly important to better understand the cross-linguistic persuasive communication conveyed through media, such as advertisement, which is considered one of the most active form of modern media. In achieving this goal, intertextuality study in the pragmatic field proves to be helpful. Employing quantitative and qualitative approaches, we compare English and Chinese texts of advertisements in *Cosmopolitan*, the most sellable female fashion magazine, with the study focused on lexical, thematic and cultural intertextuality. It is found that the globalization of advertisement for female products and services are dependent on local culture and language. The analysis of intertextuality between two texts will contribute to researches on female advertisements and international marketing strategy.

1. Introduction

Businesses are faced with critical strategic choices in the process of internationalization. Two different international marketing strategies have emerged, which offers marketers contrasting approaches to the task of entering and serving foreign markets: globalization and localization. Many studies have appeared arguing the pros and cons of both approaches, leaving managers at a loss in choosing among the alternatives. Thinking of globalization and localization as being opposed to each other is not very helpful in understanding and explaining international strategy. Successful development of international products and marketing strategies lies in "being global and acting local"(Wills, Samli, & Jacobs, 1999). This paper studies in a commercial setting the pragmatic globalization and localization of female advertisements of different languages.

The theories popular in the pragmatic study is intertextuality, which can be defined as a text-level phenomenon describing how a text refers to other. It has been explored from many aspects, such as strong intertextuality and weak intertextuality, intratextuality and extratextuality, and thematic intertextuality and cultural intertextuality. The study aims at lexical, thematic and cultural intertextuality to analyze similarities and differences of advertising strategies between two language versions (English and Chinese) of an international fashion magazine, *Cosmopolitan,* one of the most sellable fashion magazines all over the world. To test if there exists intertextuality and to what extent intertextualy works between two versions, two corpora were established. Nouns, adjectives, verbs and conjunctions are analyzed with the function of Wordsmith and Antconc.

It is postulated that (1) two versions of *Cosmo* share persuasion elements linguistically; (2) compared with English version, Chinese version is characterized by unique features of selling appeals in China's market; and (3) Chinese version applies marketing strategies of glocalization based on local cultural and linguistic practice. The findings may be of great help and practical value to engage advertisers to pay attention to the use of intertexutual techniques in their advertisement composing for international market.

2. Literature Review

2.1 Glocalization
Glocalization, which combines globalization and localization, means "the creation of products or services intended for the global market, but customized to suit the local cultures."(http://www.wordspy.com/words/). The term, which combines the words *globalization* and *localization*, first appeared in the late 1980s in articles by Japanese economists in the *Harvard Business Review*. Since then, the concept of globalization has been widely used to study how social and cultural elements influence selling strategies in the commercial setting.

2.2 Language Strategy of Glocalization
English, as the most favored language of global advertising, is commonly used in non- English- speaking countries. It is considered as a communication tool to serve modernity, progress, and globalization. China, where English is taught as a foreign language in school, is also engaged in this process of globalization, for example, consumption for beauty's sake in China cost about RMB 3,618 as early as in 2006. Even though English gains an overwhelming popularity in China with the number of English learners reaching almost 0.3 billion, the English- literate consumers are far from enough, since most English learners are students, which leads to the result that many international brands are still advertised in Chinese. Undoubtedly, Chinese consumers should have a better understanding of the global products and services advertised in English in terms of their specifications, functions and messages. "Global products, local language" is one of the effective business strategies of globalization to *COSMO*, which is published in 28 languages, with 110 editions, reaching 36 million women worldwide (Carr, 2002).

2.3 Intertextuality

Kristeva (1980) created and introduced the term "intertextuality" in her article *Le mot，le dialogue，le roman (Words, Dialogue, Novel)* published in the French magazine Tel Quel. In l969, she formally put forward the term intertextuality，which"refers to the existence of prior discourses as a precondition for the act of signifying，almost regardless of the semantic content of a given text". In her opinion ,"every text is constructed as a mosaic of quotations. Every text is the absorption and transformation of other texts".

The term intertextuality refers to the relationship between a given text and other texts. The fundamental concept of intertextuality is that no text is original and unique in itself；it's related to one text or another in some way, or rather as a"tissue"of some text. Many aspects of intertextuality have been discussed in the academia, and the relevant dimensions to the present study focus on lexical intertextualiy, thematic intertextuality and cultural intextuality.

Thematic intertextuality means that texts share same theme or topic. "Thematic intertextuality refers to how different texts express similar meanings. That is, it refers to the ways such texts express the same content or is 'on the same topic.'" (Bruna & Gomez, 2009).

Cultural intertextuality refers to the perspective through which cultural elements, beliefs, etc, are considered. "Texts are made up of what is at times styled 'the cultural (or social) text', all the different discourses, ways of speaking and saying, institutionally sanctioned structures and systems which make up what we call culture. In this sense, the text is not an individual, isolated object but, rather, a compilation of cultural textuality" (Allen, 2000).

The theory of intertextuality makes it possible to analyze the pragmatic glocalization of international mass media, such as international fashion magazine, from the perspectives of similarities and differences on the lexical, thematic and cultural levels. In addition, the dynamic interplay across lexical choice, thematic design and cultural interpretation will contribute to the important yet under-researched topic of glocalization in the field of discourse-related study. International marketers will also be informed of pragmatic strategies for cross- cultural advertising.

3. Methodology

3.1 Design

For a comparative study on English and Chinese versions of advertisements in *COSMO*, the research is carried out in the following procedure: with the help of Wordsmith tools (version 4.0) and AntConc software (version 3.3.4), two corpora, EVC and CVC, are firstly constructed to generate the concordances and wordlists; secondly, based on the shared high- frequency vocabulary, similar linguistic strategies applied in international marketing for two versions are discussed; and then, based on the unshared vocabulary, different linguistic strategies applied in international marketing for two versions are discussed; next, for the

information which can not be identified by analytic tools directly, manual work and random sampling are adopted. Interpretation of the similarities and dissimilarities from linguistic and cultural aspects goes through all the whole analysis process. Lastly, managerial implications for international marketers are offered.

3.2 Data Collection

In general, corpus is employed to verify a hypothesis about language. It is claimed by John Sinclair (1991), Professor of Modern English Language of Birmingham University, that the beginning of any corpus study is the creation of the corpus itself. However, it is realized that the extant corpora are not always suitable for researches of difference purposes. In this case, a more suitable and effective corpus should be established. In the present study, two self-built mini-corpora are involved in the corpus-based research: English Version Corpus (hereafter EVC) and Chinese Version Corpus (hereafter CVC).

The samples of the two corpora are collected from English and Chinese versions of fashion magazine *COSMO*, covering women's issues, health, careers, self-improvement, celebrities as well as fashion and beauty. It is, therefore, an ideal option for cross-cultural or cross-language researches. Advertisements in the two corpora are all published in 2011 and 2012.

Table 1 The basic information of two corpora

	EVC (English Version of COSMO)	CVC (Chinese Version of COSMO)
File size	13,722	4,370
Advertising discourses	68	35
Tokens	2,314	2,455
Type	958	1,048

The difference in corpus size results from the fact that the number of collected advertisements that cover an A4-size page in two versions are not the same, with 68 pieces of advertisement in English *COSMO,* but only 35 in Chinese *COSMO*.

4. Results and Discussion

To start with the analysis, the high-frequency words of each corpus are presented and analyzed, which emphasizes the similarities of two versions, accompanied by the differences between them.

4.1 High-frequency Words in Two Corpora

Word lists are extracted respectively from EVC and CVC. Since some of the functional words are of little relevance to the purpose of the study, articles and pronouns, such as *the*, *and*, *a*, *an* in EVC, and 的, 一, 和, 及 in CVC are excluded in the word list manually. The top 50 high-frequency words in two corpora are given as in

Table 2 Top 50 high-frequency words in two corpora

Rank	EVC	Freq.	CVC	Freq.
1	TO	49	白	87
2	YOUR	37	肌肤	60
3	SKIN	35	美	40
4	YOU	26	斑	30
5	FOR	25	净	19
6	HAIR	18	透	14
7	NEW	18	亮	12
8	CAN	14	精华	12
9	SO	14	完美	11
10	MORE	12	女性	10
11	GET	10	科技	10
12	WEAR	9	能量	10
13	EVERY	8	蛋白	10
14	FEEL	8	黑色素	10
15	LOOK	8	全新	9
16	BEAUTIFUL	7	天然	9
17	MOST	7	新	9
18	SMOOTH	7	无瑕	9
19	VOLUME	7	暗	9
20	WOMEN	7	植物	9
21	OIL	6	淡	9
22	DAYS	5	皙	9
23	GOOD	5	抗	8
24	LIKE	5	珍珠	8
25	MOISTURIZER	5	发现	7
26	SENSITIVE	5	成分	7
27	WET	5	护	7
28	YOUTH	5	细胞	7
29	ADVANCED	4	黄	7
30	ANTI	4	弹性	6
31	BEAUTY	4	有效	6
32	BETTER	4	开始	6
33	BIKINI	4	焕发	6
34	BIO	4	精粹	6
35	CLEAR	4	纯净	6
36	COLOR	4	肤色	6
37	FACE	4	透亮	6

38	FIT	4	天山	5
39	FRAGRANCE	4	年轻	5
40	FREE	4	改善	5
41	GENES	4	新生	5
42	HELP	4	润	5
43	INSTANTLY	4	皮肤	5
44	KISS	4	细腻	5
45	LIFE	4	蛋白质	5
46	MOISTURE	4	内在	4
47	NAILS	4	太极	4
48	RUN	4	对抗	4
49	SOFT	4	持久	4
50	STRETCH	4	维生素	4

It shows that these two versions do not have very specialized or uncommon vocabulary, making women's magazines an 'easy-read'. As del- Tesco- Craviotto (2006) put, women's magazines serve for entertainment and distractions, as can be expected, so they are valued mainly because they do not require much concentration. The everyday feeling the shared vocabulary presents thus contributes to the appeal of reading women's magazines.

As can be seen, all these lexically similar words (skin-肌肤, new-新, beauty-美, smooth/moisture-润, women-女性, youth-年轻, clear-净, color-肤色, clear-纯净) convey the advertising message that the two versions of magazine both cater to the demand of women's pursuit of physical attractiveness, which is actually a globalization- oriented selling strategy. Appearance and beauty is an everlasting subject among women. It is reported that advertisements of cosmetics and skin-care products on *COSMO* take an average of more than 30% annually. Smooth, unlined, lawless and moisturizing skin is the common standard for feminine charm over the whole world. *COSMO* targets at global female consumers by including and providing many beauty-related advertisements. The globalization strategy is successfully implemented through the internationalized selling appeals.

What is also being noticeable is that some of the high-frequency adjectives in one corpus rarely appeared in another. The employment of words like *healthy(-ier)* and *kiss(able)* is only found in EVC, revealing the consumption demands of local market, largely attributable to cultural practice of aesthetic orientation. The west such as Americans, although discriminate races of naturally- dark color, regard dark skin as a symbol of health and beauty. They never use parasols, but manage in spending time on the beach to get skin tanned, and use ultraviolet bin and brown stain spray to look darker. Here are some selected concordance lines.

Cleaner skin is the first step toward healthier skin. And healthier skin is

their skin left smoother, fresher and healthier instantly. I take beauty

first step toward healthier skin. And healthier skin is smoother, more the long-lasting moisture they

need- kiss after luscious kiss

A Kiss of Smoothness makes lips more kissable than the leading lip balm.

On the other hand, beauty concept in China's culture is characterized by white and fair skin. Here are some selected concordance lines:

从根源祛斑，由内养白。全新清澈净白淡斑系列...

赶走瑕疵、暗黄，重现肌肤弹润透白。一滴，令肌肤柔韧

澄澈净白纯美宣言。缔造纯净透白美肌，珍珠白想白就白

The preference for white and fair skin can date back to as early as in Xizhou Dynasty (1123-256 B.C.). In *the Poem Book* (one of the earliest poem collections in China), a belle was described to have "her skin so glossy just like grease" (肤如凝脂). Chinese believe that "a white complexion is powerful enough to hide seven faults"(一白遮三丑). Even nowadays, the ideal female partners to men in China are always those females who are fair-skinned and attractive from decent family (白富美).

COSMO is successful in adapting to Chinese consumers' demands when advertising international beauty products, not only through appealing to the preferred cultural concepts but also taking linguistic differences into consideration.

4.2 Conjunctive Adjuncts

Apart from depending on analytic softwares, we conduct the study manually by looking into the samples directly. It is noted that some conjunctive adjuncts, like *if, because* and *so*, appear repeatedly in EVC. Here are some of the concordance lines.

Vibrant with youth, skin looks as if lit from within- breathtakingly you face the world with confidence, because when your skin is clear, so is

and irritation after removing hair so you can be confident and sexy

can also be good for your skin. That's why it's important to wear Day Wear.

is Laura's inspiration. Which is why she created a luxurious collection

formulated and clinically proven to reduce and improve the appearance of

According to M.A.K.Halliday's systemic-functional framework, an analytic model proved to be well-suited to the analysis of natural texts, the set of connectives and conjunctive adjuncts is usually applied for reason persuasion. There are four main types of conjunctive adjunct identified, additive, adversative, conditional and causal.

The use of conditional conjunctive adjunct (such as if...then), by exhibiting a propositional structure, directly informs the customers of the reason for purchase and the positive and beneficial consequence they will get. The category of conjunctive adjunct is the casual (such as *so*, *because*, *that's why*), by which a reason-plus-result or cause-plus-effect sequence is displayed. This structure, in a direct route, also tries to tell customers the product characteristics and the reasons why they should choose it. The conjunctive adjunct very noticeable in the present thesis is purposive (such as *in order to*, *to+V.*), which demonstrates obviously

the benefit and consequence brought by the products.

While in CVC, no cohesive devices can be found, which is due to the differences between Chinese and English. English is a hypotactic-oriented language, featured by the tightly-knitted structures. Both words and sentences are supposed to represent clear logic relations. Discourse understanding is achieved by analyzing the precise language with rigorous forms and by probing the internal relation between words and sentences. Therefore, coherence in English discourse is facilitated by overt cohesive devices. On the contrary, Chinese is paratactic-oriented, laying less emphasis on cohesive forms, and thus, the sentence structures are more flexible. Discourse understanding depends more on the context and the reader's imagination, therefore, Chinese discourse coherence is sometimes not realized by explicit cohesive devices but relies on covert cohesive mechanisms.

It is unquestionable that marketers have no choice but follow the linguistic practice of the local language, but the finding in point is that the advertisers make a clear and unambiguous statement on the product qualities and reasons to persuade purchases. Employment of different cohesive mechanisms in advertising discourse, either implicit or explicit, is evident in both EVC and CVC, in a way that reason appeals become increasingly popular.

4.3 Numbers and Expressions of Time

For launching a new product, advertising may be the most effective way to grab the attention of readers, listeners and viewers. Using numbers properly in advertising, a global advertising behavior can effectively enhance brands' credibility and impressiveness.   In the analysis, numbers are found to be widely used in both English and Chinese versions, but in completely distinctive ways. Here are some examples selected from two corpora.

> look denser and more numerous in 30 days. Up to 12x fuller looking lashes
> See visibly younger skin in just 7 days.   10 years of research
> Soothing Moisturizer   Give us one week and we'll change your sensitive
> smooth and hair-free in as little as six months. Imagine- no more endless
> 短短数周，色斑显著减少。日复一日，形成中的色斑在浮现之前即被消褪。
> 一天天，开始有效对抗皱纹，改善细滑肤质；一周周，改善 5 大肌肤维度

In English advertisements, specific or real numbers are prevailing semantically, but as far as persuasion is concerned, what these numbers imply is that in a short time, instead of precisely in 30 days or in one week, the products will display their beautifying effect. Numbers have fuzzy meanings. Numbers, besides serving the calculation, are also functional linguistically. In syntax, numbers present a concept of fuzziness when they don't refer to the exact quantity. In Chinese advertisements, numbers clearly refer to ambiguous meanings, such as 日复一日，数周，一天天，上一秒...下一秒.

The wide use of fuzzy numbers in both versions is a demonstration of the fuzziness power to inspire readers' association and imagination through enhancing the rhetorical function of language, which is a popular strategy of global advertisement. However, due to the language differences between Chinese and English, two

versions apply strikingly different lexical choices. This is a linguistically localized advertising strategy.

4.4 Non- intertextuality between two corpora

During the process of analyzing intertextual elements in the two versions of female advertisements, a non-intertextual phenomenon came into our sight that about 32.4% brands in CVC have rarely appeared in EVC. In addition, some technical words indicating the unique traits of local brands are not found in EVC, such as those related to traditional Chinese medicine. It implies that Chinese brands, as well as those from other Asian countries like Japan and Korea, have not entered the American market, and therefore, should strengthen global marketing strategies in the international market based on improved quality of products and advertisements.

5. Conclusion

The purpose of this research is to study the glocalization of advertisements in an international women magazine through analyzing the intertextuality between English and Chinese versions. The samples collected in two self-built corpora are from COSMO. The analysis was processed from lexical perspective, thematic perspective and cultural perspective.

The localization of advertising discourse for global products and services in women magazines is culture-related. It is found in the comparative analysis that the high-frequencady words in one corpus are echoed with those in the other by appearing in various parts of advertising texts many times. These words shared similar meanings focused on women, beauty, youth, cleaness, etc., revealing that the pursuit of beauty and youth is a universal selling appeal for women products all over the world. On the other hand, some nouns and adjectives in one corpus have no semantically-similar counterparts in the other, such as words describing light complexion in CVC and those describing sexiness in EVC, which can be explained by cultural differences of aesthetic orientations. What's more, local advertisement of international brands is language- dependent. In the present study, overwhelmingly more conjunctive devices in EVC than in CVC are used to highlight the reasons to buy, the product characteristics and the benefits of product purchase in advertising discourses, because in Chinese, the coherence is achieved through context, instead of by linking devices. The other difference of advertisement text caused by language difference is the way numbers are used, with more specific numbers in EVC and more fuzzy numbers in CVC. Either way, *COSMO* succeeds in impressing its readers that very fast the products will definitely make a difference on them. What makes the two versions of advertisement texts striking contrastive is the identification of brand names. Many international brands names are found in both versions, but no brands from China's market in EVC, such as those related to traditional Chinese medicine. Globalization of China's brands and advertisements has a long way to go.

By the intertextual analysis of the English and Chinese versions of female advertisements, the present research provides cross-language and cross-cultural perspectives to study the globalization of female advertisements. Some managerial implications can be offered. Culture is an important concern in

international business operations. In a globally commercial setting, international products and services should be advertised locally based on local customers' values, beliefs, norms, and behavioral patterns of a national group. Analyzing advertisement texts of local markets is an effective means to achieve this goal. International marketers of advertisements are supposed to be informed of the differences between the local language and the original language, so that they can know how to adapt to the linguistic demands from the lexical, semantic and syntactic perspectives. In addition, International mass media should take a broader vision to take in brands of more country origins, globalization of more products of more origins can be realized.

6. Limitations and Suggestions of Further Studies

Although several findings and implications have been presented, the study has some limitations as follows: (1) The samples under analysis are confined to only one fashion magazine and, therefore, its generalization might be affected. (2) The size of the two self-built corpora, especially that of Chinese Version Corpus, is not big enough and the number of advertising discourses in two corpora are not the same, which, to some limited extent, may reduce the number of data usable for intertextual comparison. (3) Only three types of intertextuality are discussed in the paper.

The study in this paper may suggest some interesting topics for further research, which will lead to more studies of the intertextual techniques in the international commercial background. For instance, female advertisements published in different periods can be compared for the analysis of intertextual changes to see how glocalization changes and develops; how female advertisements in different languages of the same brand echo with each other. The author expects that current research can enlighten inspiration for further study.

References

Allen, G. (2000). Intertextuality. London: Routledge.

Bruna, K. R. & Gomez, K. (2009). The Work of Language in Multicultural Classrooms: Talking Science, Writing Science. New York: Routledge. 42.

Carr, D. (2002, May 26). Romance, in Cosmo's world, is translated in many ways. New York Times, 1.

del-Teso-Craviotto, Marisol. (2006). Words that matter: Lexical choice and gender ideologies in women's magazines, Journal of Pragmatics, 38 (2006): 2003-2021.

Halliday, M. A. K. & Christian Matthiessen. (2004). An Introduction to Functional Grammar. (3rd edition). London: Arnold.

Kristeva, J. (1980). Desire in Language: A Semiotic Approach to Literature and Art. Oxford: Blackwell.

Sinclair, J. & Renouf, A. (1991). Collocational frameworks in English. In K. Aijmer and B. Altenberg (eds.) English Corpus Linguistics. London: Longman.

Wills, J., Coskun A. S. & Jacobs L. (1991). Developing Global Products and Marketing Strategies: A Construct and a Research Agenda, Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science, 19 (Winter), 1-10.